Musing New Museology:
Politics of the Hong Kong Museum of Art

HO Kin Chung Louis

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

Principal Supervisor: Prof. MAN Eva Kit-wah

Hong Kong Baptist University

April 2013
Abstract

By the end of the 1980s, two significant groups of museologists arose in the academia of museology in Germany and Britain, and have given a remarkable contribution to the establishment of a new standpoint in museology – the new museology. The new museology refers not only to a theoretical perspective in museology but also to wider changes in the museum world. Since the 1970s, the new museology inspired by critical theories and cultural studies has formed a climate of increasing reflexivity in the museum world. In this regard, I wonder: Does the new museology lead to another form of simplification and reduction? Where are the local museums, especially those with the postcolonial and global context, in these discussions? How does museum as cultural production interact with the new museology as theory in its practices? This thesis explores these questions with a local text – the Hong Kong Museum of Art (HKMA) – and argues that the local practices of the HKMA significantly negotiate with the new museological discourse in the postcolonial and global context.
Table of Contents

Declaration .............................................................................................................. i
Abstract ............................................................................................................... ii
Acknowledgements ............................................................................................. iii
Table of Contents ................................................................................................. iv
List of Figures ...................................................................................................... viii

Chapter One:
Introduction ........................................................................................................... 1
1.1 Background: Museums and Museology ......................................................... 1
1.2 Research Objectives and Significance......................................................... 7
1.3 The Design of the Study .............................................................................. 11

Chapter Two:
The New Museological Discourse in the Contemporary World ...................... 16
2.1 The Present State of Museology: The New Museology .............................. 16
2.1.1 Museum as Text ...................................................................................... 23
2.1.2 Museums as Sites of Power ................................................................. 26
2.1.3 Museum Skeptics and Optimists ......................................................... 29
2.2 Summary: Impact of the New Museology in the Museum World ............... 37

Chapter Three:
Interpreting the Historiographies of the Hong Kong Museum of Art .......... 41
3.1 Historical Representations of the HKMA ................................................. 42
3.2 The Hegemonic Grand Narrative in the Historiography of the HKMA …… 47
3.3 Re-articulating the Histories of the HKMA ................................. 55
3.4 The Myth of Professionalism ....................................................... 63
3.5 Structuring Absence in the Hong Kong Museum Story ................. 69
3.6 Summary: Stories of the HKMA .................................................. 76

Chapter Four:
Representing Parallelism in the Colonial and Postcolonial Contexts ……… 79
4.1 Iconographic Programming of the HKMA’s Museum Space ............. 80
4.2 “Diversity with Identity”: The Hong Kong Cultural Policy and the HKMA .. 83
4.3 Mapping the Exhibitions: Parallelism and Trinomial Structure in the HKMA 87
4.4 Claiming the Traditional Chinese Feature ...................................... 94
4.5 Defining Hongkongness instead of Hong Kong Art .......................... 100
4.6 Re-nationalizing the Museum ..................................................... 107
4.7 Summary ................................................................................... 113

Chapter Five:
Tactics of Local Museums: the Supplements of Philanthropy and Blockbusters . 117
5.1 Setting the Scene: The Corporatization of Museums and the WKCD ........ 118
5.2 Consideration of the Rejuvenation of the HKMA ............................. 122
5.2.1 The Art of Philanthropy: Wu Guanzhong’s Donations .................... 126
5.2.2 Tactics of a Local Museum: Loan Exhibitions and Blockbusters ........ 135
5.3 Summary: Rethinking the Supplement .......................................... 142
Chapter Six:

Struggles in the Field of Cultural Production at the Hong Kong Museum of Art . 146
6.1 From the LV Issue ................................................................. 147
6.1.1 Whose Museum? ............................................................. 150
6.1.2 Considering the Notion of Museum/Curator .......................... 156
6.2 Struggles and Beyond: Museum/Curator and Local Artists ....... 160
6.2.1 Case 1: Choi Yan Chi ....................................................... 162
6.2.2 Case 2: Leung Mee Ping .................................................. 169
6.2.3 Case 3: Ellen Pau ............................................................ 174
6.2.4 Case 4: Pak Sheung Chuen, Tozer ................................. 179
6.3 Interactions as Cultural Production and Museums as Contact Zone ...... 186
6.4 Summary .............................................................................. 188

Chapter Seven:

The New Museology Re-imagined ........................................... 191
7.1 Interpreting the New Museology ........................................ 192
7.2 The Political Economy of the HKMA in the Post-modern Period .... 196
7.3 A Mapping of Museology at the HKMA ............................... 202
7.4 The Literary Turn of the HKMA ....................................... 206
7.5 New Museology as Pastiche ............................................. 210
7.6 Summary .............................................................................. 217

Chapter Eight:

Conclusion: the Cultural Circuit of the HKMA ......................... 220
Notes .............................................................................................................. 230

Appendix 1: Summary of Museum Definition according to the ICOM Statutes
(1946 – 2007) ..................................................................................................... 237

Appendix 2: Public Museums under Management of Leisure and Cultural Services Department ............................................................................................................. 240

Appendix 3: Summary of the Culture and Heritage Commission’s Major Recommendations on Museums ............................................................................................................. 242

Appendix 4: Summary of the Consultancy Study’s Major Recommendations ................................................................. 244

Appendix 5: List of Exhibitions held by the Hong Kong Museum of Art
(1991-2009) ..................................................................................................... 247

Appendix 6: Coding Sheet for a Study of the Hong Kong Museum of Art’s Exhibitions ............................................................................................................. 256

Appendix 7: Notes on Museum Economies in Hong Kong ........................................... 260

References ..................................................................................................... 279

Curriculum Vitae ............................................................................................. 315