Fostering Knowledge Contribution in Online Communities:
An Examination of Social Capital, Social Capital Building, and
the Role of IT Artifacts

LAW Pui Man, Sally

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

Principal Supervisor: Dr. CHANG Ludwig M K

Hong Kong Baptist University

December 2011
ABSTRACT

Online communities have great potential for being an ongoing source of knowledge and learning support nowadays. However, this potential cannot be realized unless individuals are motivated to contribute their knowledge there. Despite the growing application of the social capital theory to studying knowledge contribution behavior in online communities, the extant research has focused on examining the direct linkage between social capital and knowledge contribution, neglecting the suggestion that social capital only provides favorable conditions for knowledge sharing but does not incorporate the motivational content needed to induce an intention to act within a person. Moreover, even if social capital is widely regarded as an important driver of knowledge contribution, no systematic research has been conducted to examine the way to build social capital in online communities, and especially, to find out how IT artifacts can support the development of social capital. This thesis attempts to address the above issues by proposing and testing a research model that analyzes the mediating mechanism between social capital and knowledge contribution, as well as the IT-enabled interventions to build social capital in online communities.

Using Nahapiet and Ghoshal’s (1998) social capital model as the starting point, we have incorporated the insights derived from different theoretical perspectives to formulate our research model. First, drawing upon the work of Portes and colleagues (1998; 1993), the social exchange theory, the social identity theory, the literature on social network and status attainment, and prior research on group identification, we propose anticipated status enhancement and community identification as the motivational forces behind individuals’ knowledge contribution behavior and theorize their roles in explaining the linkage between social capital and knowledge contribution. Second, drawing upon prior research on social capital and supplementing it with the literatures of self-disclosure, homophily, language games, and the reasoning about incentives and sanctions, we propose four IT-enabled social capital builders, including identity profiling, sub-community building, feedback mechanism, and regulatory practice, and theorize their potential in supporting the formation of social capital in online communities.

The proposed model was empirically tested with survey data from 448 members of different online communities. Results from PLS analyses suggest that anticipated status enhancement and community identification are significant motivators of knowledge contribution and that they mediate the effects of different social capital factors (instrumental network ties, expressive network ties, community trustworthiness, and norms of cooperation) on knowledge contribution. Also, our results confirm the hypothesized role of all IT-enabled social capital builders and demonstrate their potential to support social capital-building in online communities. Overall, this thesis makes two main contributions. First, by analyzing the mediating mechanism that underlies the social capital-knowledge contribution linkage, we enhance the understanding of how and why social capital facilitates knowledge contribution. Second, by theorizing and confirming the role of IT artifacts in supporting social capital-building in online communities, we provide the theoretical directions for identifying other useful social capital builders in online contexts and the pragmatic guidelines for designing online communities that are conducive to knowledge sharing among individuals.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration ..............................................................................................................i
Abstract ..................................................................................................................ii
Acknowledgements ..................................................................................................iii
List of Tables ...........................................................................................................ix
List of Figures ..........................................................................................................x

Chapter 1 Introduction .......................................................................................... 1
  1.1 Background and Importance of the Current Study ........................................ 1
  1.2 Objectives of the Current Study .................................................................... 6
  1.3 Organization of the Thesis ............................................................................ 7

Chapter 2 Literature Review ................................................................................... 9
  2.1 Knowledge Exchange Online Community .................................................. 10
  2.2 Social Capital and Knowledge Exchange .................................................... 11
  2.3 Social Capital: Its Definition and Components ............................................ 12
    2.3.1 The Private-Good View of Social Capital ............................................. 13
    2.3.2 The Public-Good View of Social Capital ............................................ 15
    2.3.3 Social Capital in Context: A Joint Consideration of Both Views .............. 17
  2.4 Nahapiet and Ghoshal’s Social Capital Model of Knowledge Exchange ............. 19
    2.4.1 The Structural Dimension of Social Capital: Individuals’ Network Ties within the Online Community ................................................................. 22
    2.4.2 The Cognitive Dimension of Social Capital: The Shared Language within the Online Community ................................................................. 28
    2.4.3 The Relational Dimension of Social Capital: The Online Community’s Trustworthiness and Its Norms of Cooperation ........................................... 29
  2.5 Extant Knowledge Exchange Research Involving Social Capital ....................... 32
  2.6 Instrumental and Consummatory Motivations .............................................. 35
    2.6.1 Instrumental Motivation ........................................................................ 35
    2.6.2 Consummatory Motivation .................................................................... 36
  2.7 Social Capital as Trigger of Instrumental Motivation and Consummatory Motivation ........................................................................................................ 38
2.7.1 Social Capital and Status Attainment in Online Communities ......40
2.7.2 Social Capital and Identification with Online Communities .......41
2.8 Antecedents of Social Capital and IT-enabled Social Capital Builders ....48
  2.8.1 Self-disclosure and the Formation of Network Ties: The Role of Identity Profiling ..........................................................50
  2.8.2 Homophily and the Formation of Network Ties: The Role of Sub-community Building .........................................................57
  2.8.3 Incentives and Sanctions and the Formation of Trustworthiness and Norms: The Role of Feedback Mechanism and Regulatory Practice .............................................61
  2.8.4 Language Games and the Development of Shared Language: The Role of Sub-community Building and Regulatory Practice Again .........................................................66
2.9 A Recap on the Literature Review .................................................................72

Chapter 3 Research Model ..............................................................................73

3.1 Overview of the Research Model .................................................................73
3.2 Knowledge Contribution: The Eventual Outcome Construct .......................77
3.3 Hypotheses for the Relationship between Instrumental Motivation & Consummatory Motivation and Knowledge Contribution .......................77
  3.3.1 Hypothesized Effect of Anticipated Status Enhancement on Knowledge Contribution ..........................................................78
  3.3.2 Hypothesized Effect of Community Identification on Knowledge Contribution .............................................................79
3.4 Hypotheses for the Relationship between Social Capital and Anticipated Status Enhancement .................................................................80
  3.4.1 Hypothesized Effects of Instrumental Network Ties and Expressive Network Ties on Anticipated Status Enhancement ......80
3.5 Hypotheses for the Relationship between Social Capital and Community Identification .................................................................82
  3.5.1 Hypothesized Effects of Instrumental Network Ties and Expressive Network Ties on Community Identification ...............83
  3.5.2 Hypothesized Effect of Shared Language on Community Identification ......................................................................................84
  3.5.3 Hypothesized Effects of Community Trustworthiness and Norms of Cooperation on Community Identification ................85
3.6 Mediating Role of Instrumental Motivation & Consummatory Motivation in the Relationship between Social Capital and Knowledge Contribution ..............................................87
3.7 Hypotheses for the Relationship between Use of IT Artifacts and Social Capital .................................................................................................................. 89
3.7.1 Hypothesized Effects of Use of Identity Profiling and Use of Sub-community Building on Instrumental Network Ties and Expressive Network Ties ............................................................ 90
3.7.2 Hypothesized Effects of Use of Sub-community Building and Use of Regulatory Practice on Shared Language ................................................. 94
3.7.3 Hypothesized Effects of Use of Feedback Mechanism and Use of Regulatory Practice on Community Trustworthiness and Norms of Cooperation ..................................................................................... 97

Chapter 4 Research Method ............................................................................ 103

4.1 Sample and Research Design .................................................................... 103
4.2 Development of Survey Questionnaire .................................................... 105
4.3 The Finalized Survey Questionnaire ........................................................ 107
  4.3.1 Measurement for Knowledge Contribution ........................................... 107
  4.3.2 Measurement for Anticipated Status Enhancement ............................. 108
  4.3.3 Measurement for Community Identification ....................................... 108
  4.3.4 Measurements for Instrumental Network Ties and Expressive Network Ties ..................................................................................................... 108
  4.3.5 Measurement for Shared Language ..................................................... 109
  4.3.6 Measurement for Community Trustworthiness ................................. 109
  4.3.7 Measurement for Norms of Cooperation ............................................ 110
  4.3.8 Measurements for Identity Profiling, Sub-community Building, Feedback Mechanism, and Regulatory Practice ..................................... 110
4.4 Selection of Research Sites for Data Collection ....................................... 111
4.5 Survey Administration ............................................................................. 112

Chapter 5 Data Analysis and Results ................................................................. 116

5.1 Descriptive Statistics and Sample Characteristics .................................... 116
5.2 Construct Validation and Hypothesis Testing .......................................... 118
  5.2.1 Measurement Model Analysis ............................................................. 118
  5.2.2 Structural Model Analysis .................................................................. 123
  5.2.3 Mediation Analysis ............................................................................. 127

Chapter 6 Discussions and Conclusions ........................................................... 137

6.1 Overview of Research Findings ................................................................. 137
6.2 Mediating Role of Anticipated Status Enhancement and Community Identification in the Social Capital-Knowledge Contribution Linkage....138

6.3 Social Capital-Building and the Role of IT Artifacts in Online Communities......................................................................................................................... 143

6.3.1 Effects of Use of Identity Profiling and Use of Sub-community Building on the Structural Dimension of Social Capital.............. 146

6.3.2 Effects of Use of Sub-community Building and Use of Regulatory Practice on the Cognitive Dimension of Social Capital................................................................. 150

6.3.3 Effects of Use of Feedback Mechanism and Use of Regulatory Practice on the Relational Dimension of Social Capital................................................................. 151

6.4 Usefulness of Separating Network Ties into Instrumental Network Ties and Expressive Network Ties ........................................................ 152

6.5 Managerial Implications.............................................................................................................................. 153

6.6 Limitations and Suggestions for Future Research................................. 156

6.7 Contributions of the Current Study .............................................................. 159

List of References................................................................................................................................. 163

Appendix A Prior Knowledge Management Studies Involving Social Capital .......................................................... 182

Appendix B Operationalization of Constructs............................................. 191

Appendix C Survey Questionnaire............................................................... 196

Appendix D List of Research Sites .................................................................................. 202

Curriculum Vitae................................................................................................................................. 211