An Identity Formation through Collective Action in a New Social Movement in Hong Kong
– A Case Study of the Post-80s Anti-Express Rail Link Youth

WANG Jieying

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Philosophy

Principal Supervisor: Dr. LEE Alice Y. L.
Hong Kong Baptist University
August 2011
ABSTRACT

This research examines the collective identity formation by a group of young people who actively engaged in the anti-express rail link (anti-XRL) protest. It started from the end of 2009 and is regarded as a new social movement. This group of youths, without party or class base, organized and actively participated in the movement with a slogan “post-80s”, which signifies the new social force constituted by the youths rather than refers to the people within a specific age range. A qualitative approach is adopted in this case study with in-depth interview, participant observation and document study as the major research methods, analyzing different dimensions of the anti-XRL post-80s identity formation. Three research questions: what is the post-80s collective identity; how did they form the collective identity through the movement; and why did they form the post-80s identity through this particular new social movement, are answered.

Findings show that, this is a group of youths embracing dispositional commonalities and sharing social values towards different social problems. In the movement, they gradually formed and consolidated the sense of solidarity against the authorities, and the respect for individuality and citizen empowerment, through various collective action plans, verbal tactics, organizational and communication forms. In addition, several forms of new media were utilized by the youths to create their own discourse field, alternative to the hegemony of mainstream media. An autonomous and initiative role and independent thinking were held by the post-80s during interaction with other movement players, while the movement youths took side with the people. Staying an ambivalent and equal relationship with mainstream media, the post-80s activists were influenced by mainstream media coverage in terms of action planning and self perception. Rather than facing the mainstream representation of the anti-XRL youths passively, the young activists utilized their own discourse field to negotiate, reconstruct and reinforce their expected post-80s identity, as responding to stereotyping in mainstream media.

Theoretically, this research includes the relational dimension (interaction between the post-80s with other entities) as one of the important factors in the process of the post-80s collective identity formation, which has been overlooked by previous scholars. Practically, through an in-depth look into the micro and dynamic perspective of this group of young activists, this research is hoped to contribute to policy makers’ better understanding on this type of the young generation, and to the academic field of social movement and youth study in Hong Kong.

Keywords: new social movement, identity, post-80s
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION .................................................................................................................... ii  
ABSTRACT ....................................................................................................................... iii  
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT ..................................................................................................... iv  
TABLE OF CONTENTS ....................................................................................................... vi  

Chapter One Introduction ...................................................................................................... 1  

1.1 Research Purpose ........................................................................................................... 2  
1.2 Research Significance ..................................................................................................... 3  
  1.2.1 Theoretical Significance ........................................................................................... 3  
  1.2.2 Practical Significance ............................................................................................... 6  
1.3 Definition of the Research Subject – The Post-80s ......................................................... 9  
1.4 Organization of the Thesis ............................................................................................. 12  

Chapter Two Literature Review .......................................................................................... 14  

2.1 Traditional Social Movement Theories ......................................................................... 14  
2.2 New Social Movement .................................................................................................. 16  
  2.2.1 Different academic versions of new social movement ........................................... 17  
  2.2.2 Debates on the newness of new social movements ............................................... 18  
  2.2.3 Characteristics of new social movements ............................................................ 19  
2.3 The Root of Identity Seeking ........................................................................................ 22  
2.4 Collective Identity ........................................................................................................ 24  
2.5 Collective Identity Analysis .......................................................................................... 26  
  2.5.1 Emotional investment ............................................................................................. 29  
  2.5.2 Cultural practices .................................................................................................... 30  
  2.5.3 Organization and network as culture ................................................................. 34  
  2.5.4 Relational dimension of collective identity ....................................................... 35  
2.6 New Media Use as Culture .......................................................................................... 36  
2.7 New Media Use and Social Participation ....................................................................... 37
Chapter Two .................................................................................................................. 28

2.1 Social Movement ........................................................................................................ 28
2.2 Collective Action ........................................................................................................ 31

2.3 New Media .................................................................................................................. 34

2.4 Framing Identity in New Social Movement.............................................................. 36

2.5 Movement-Media Relationship .............................................................................. 40

Chapter Three Conceptual Framework .......................................................................... 50

3.1 Conceptual Framework ............................................................................................. 51

3.2 Analytical Dimensions of Collective Identity Formation ......................................... 52

3.3 Emotional Investment .............................................................................................. 53

3.4 Cultural Practices ..................................................................................................... 55

3.5 Text and Framing ..................................................................................................... 59

3.6 Organization and Communication Technology ..................................................... 61

3.7 Relational Dimension ............................................................................................. 63

Chapter Four Methodology ........................................................................................... 66

4.1 The Case Study ......................................................................................................... 66

4.2 Semi-Structured Interview .................................................................................... 67

4.2.1 Sampling procedure ......................................................................................... 68

4.2.2 Interview procedure ......................................................................................... 69

4.3 Participant Observation ......................................................................................... 71

4.4 Document Study .................................................................................................... 72

4.4.1 Framing analysis .............................................................................................. 73

4.4.2 Facebook groups ............................................................................................. 76

4.4.3 Newspaper ...................................................................................................... 77

Chapter Five The Anti-XRL Movement ....................................................................... 79

5.1 Hong Kong as a Post-industrial and Democratic Society ........................................ 79

5.2 The Anti-Express Railway Link Movement ............................................................. 80
7.3 Cultural Narratives ........................................................................................................... 143
  7.3.1 Universal-value narratives – human and nature ................................................... 143
  7.3.2 Historical narratives – movement continuity...................................................... 147
  7.3.3 Worldly narratives – people cannot live without consuming ......................... 150
7.4 Empathy ....................................................................................................................... 152
  7.4.1 Individual Empowerment .................................................................................. 153
  7.4.2 Considerate to the public ................................................................................ 156

Chapter Eight Text and Framing ...................................................................................... 162
  8.1 Diagnostic Frame ....................................................................................................... 164
  8.2 Prognostic Frame .................................................................................................... 170
  8.3 Motivational Frame ............................................................................................... 175
  8.4 Presentation of Frames in Different Media ............................................................ 179
  8.5 Identity Fields ........................................................................................................... 180

Chapter Nine Organization and Communication ............................................................ 183
  9.1 Organization .............................................................................................................. 184
    9.1.1 Network based formation ................................................................................ 185
    9.1.2 Individual contributing negotiation ............................................................... 189
    9.1.3 Fully-discussed decision making .................................................................... 192
  9.2 Communication ....................................................................................................... 195
    9.2.1 Interpersonal communication ......................................................................... 196
    9.2.2 Various forms of communication via new media technologies .................... 198
    9.2.3 The controversial role of Facebook ................................................................. 201
    9.2.4 Facebook opens an alternative information pool .......................................... 203
    9.2.5 Facebook as an emotional outlet ................................................................. 205
    9.2.6 Shortcomings of Facebook communication .................................................... 207
    9.2.7 The power of human agency .......................................................................... 209
Chapter Ten Relational Dimension of Collective Identity

10.1 Post-80s with the Victims and Other Protesters

10.2 Post-80s with Political Parties

10.3 Post-80s with Civic Organizations

10.4 Relationship between the Post-80s Activists and Mainstream Media

10.4.1 Mainstream media in Hong Kong and in the anti-XRL movement

10.4.2 Journalists in the anti-XRL movement

10.4.3 Mainstream and independent media

10.4.4 Ambiguity and dynamics between movement Actors and mainstream media

10.4.5 When the post-80s meet the mainstream coverage on them

Chapter Eleven The Collective Identity of the Anti-XRL Post-80s

11.1 The Bringing forward of the Slogan “Post-80s”

11.2 Collective Identity of the Anti-XRL Post-80s

11.3 Post-80s In-the-Making

Chapter Twelve Conclusion

12.1 Limitations

12.2 Directions for Future Research

References

Appendix A

Appendix B

CURRICULUM VITAE